

REF.NO. Member Secretary/CGRF/MSEDCL/BNDUZ/197/101

Date: 28.05.2019

Hearing Date: 04/12/2018

CASE NO.197/2018

In the matter of refund of tariff difference amount with interest

M/s. Shree Chintamani Automated Path Lab,
Mrs. Smita S. Khule,1st floor,Shop No.28,Sadguru Plaza,
Plot 50,Sector 40, Seawoods(W),
Navi Mumbai-400706..... **(Hereinafter referred as Applicant)**

Vs

Maharashtra state Electricity Distribution Company Ltd
Through it's Nodal Officer,
Vashi Circle,Vashi **(Hereinafter referred as Respondent)**

Appearance

For Consumer :- Shri. Pranab Shende, M/s. Strom Losunger Pvt. Ltd.

Representative for Respondent :- Shri. Dhanit , Additional Executive Engineer MSEDCL
Nerul Subdivsion,Nerul

[Coram- Dr. Santoshkumar Jaiswal- Chairperson, Shri. R.S.Avhad -Member Secretary and
Sharmila Ranade - Member (CPO)].

Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission, is, constituted u/s. 82 of Electricity Act 2003 (36/2003). Hereinafter for the sake of brevity referred as ‘MERC’. This Consumer Grievance Redressal Forum has been established as per the notification issued by MERC i.e. “Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission (Consumer Grievance Redressal

Forum & Ombudsman) Regulation 2006” to redress the grievances of consumers vide powers conferred on it by Section 181 read with subsection 5 to 7 of section 42 of the Electricity Act, (36/2003). Hereinafter it is referred as ‘Regulation’. Further the regulation has been made by MERC i.e. Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission. [Electricity Supply Code and other conditions of supply Regulations 2005] Here in after referred as ‘Supply Code’ for the sake of brevity. Even, regulation has been made by MERC i.e. ‘Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission (Standards of Performance of Distribution Licensees, Period for Giving Supply & Determination of Compensation) Regulations, 2014.’ Hereinafter referred ‘SOP’ for the sake of convenience

This application is filed by the applicant for grievances against the Respondent company MSEDCL to correct the tariff and category and refund of the amount. The Applicant Consumer above named is LT (Low Tension) having following connection of MSEDCL and drawing Electric supply from consumer No. 000338916230/PC-6, BU; 4642Nerul S/Dn. and since 26-05-2003 he is the consumer of MSEDCL. The Applicant Consumer Mrs. Khule is running/operating Hospital/Nursing Home/Diagnostic Centre/Clinic/Pathology Laboratory M/s. Shree Chintamani Automated Path. Lab” at 1st Floor, Shop No. 28, Sadguru Plaza, Plot 50, Sector 40, Seawoods (W), Navi Mumbai 400 706, Maharashtra. The Municipal/State Authorities who are authorized to issue necessary permission to operate the Hospital/Nursing Home/Diagnostic Centre/Clinic/Pathology Laboratory same has been obtained from the Municipal Corporation/State Authorities and the Hospital/Nursing Home/Diagnostic Centre/Clinic/Pathology Laboratory is providing Health Care facilities and since then the Applicant is receiving regular energy bills without any error in meter or any complaint from the representatives of the respondent company (MSEDCL), who use to visit, inspect and record the reading of the energy consumption of the electricity, for raising energy bills and the Applicant were paying towards the energy bills raised by the respondent company (MSEDCL) from time to time without any default.

The Tariff is made applicable as per Tariff order issued by the commission from time to time. As per section 62(3) Electricity Act, 2003, tariff is based on purpose of use. Section 2(15) of the electricity act provides that the consumer means any person who is supplied with electricity for his own use. Similarly section 43 of the act also provides that distribution licensee shall give supply to the occupier of the premises, Dr. Tamrkar is operating Apex Diagnostic Center is thus the end user of electricity supplied by respondent (MSEDCL).

Therefore, applicant claims that the Respondent be directed to change the tariff according to MERC orders which is applicable from 1st of June 2015. There the billing cycle of a consumer is different with respect to the date of applicability of revised tariffs, they should be made applicable for the consumption on a pro rata basis. The bills for the respective periods as per existing and revised Tariffs shall be calculate on the pro rata consumption (Units consumed during respective period arrived at on the basis of average unit consumption per day multiplied by number of days in respective period falling under the billing cycle).

In this application, applicant prayed for redressal of the grievances in respect to the non compliance of the tariff order issued by the commission for health care services and its refund for 24 months which is eligible and entitle to the consumer along with interest and cost.

The Respondent appeared and filed their point wise reply that the consumer is billed in LTII tariff and the supply date 26-05-2003. As per commercial circular no. 175 dtd. 16.08.2012, the new tariff category LT-X for public services is come into force. The said tariff category is applicable for nursing home and various public services. Now, the said consumer has applied from change in category from LT-II to LT-X, vide their application

in the month September 2017 .After receipt of the inspection report for confirmation of activities the tariff is changed to LT X (B) with effect from January 2018.

It is further say that after verification of the activities, suitable change of tariff is applied from September 2017 and as the activities prior to the application can't be ascertained, As the address of the said consumer which is mentioned on the electricity bill of consumer, does not surely state that the premises is used for hospital purpose . As per Reg.4.13 (b) of MERC Sop Regulation the change of tariff shall be effected within second billing cycle on receipt of application from consumer and the tariff shall be changed with prospective effect from the date of application. The premises was inspected and observed the hospital activity, prior to the inspection, we cannot change the tariff for the period prior to the application and as per proof of registration of hospital does not ensure that hospital started on that same day in existing premises. The consumer's pray for refund by considering retrospective effect may be disallowed.

I have gone through the contented of the grievances application and also gone through the point wise reply submitted by the Respondent. It appears admittedly that there is commercial circular no 243 of MSEDCL that as per MERC tariff order dated 26.06.2015 in the case no 121 of 2014 that the date of revised tariff is applicable from 1st June 2015 and will continue till further orders. In this circular serial No.3 the separate category for Gov. school and hospitals are come under LT X (A) and private and other category LT X(B) is made for other public services the applicability for this tariff shall be applicable to educational institutions such as schools and colleges, and Hospitals, Dispensaries, primary Health Care Centers and Pathology Laboratories and Libraries and Public reading rooms other than those of State or Central Government, Municipal Bodies, Zilla Parishads, Panchayat Samities or Gram Panchyat; all offices of Government/Municipal Bodies, Local Authority, local self Government, Zilla Parishad, and Gram Panchayat;Police Stations, Police Chowkies, Post offices, Defence establishments (army,navy and air-

force),Spiritual Organizations which are service oriented, Railway/Monorail/Metro except traction, State transport establishments,; and State Transport Workshops, Transport Workshops operated by Local Authority, Fire Services Stations, Jails, Prisons, Courts, Airports (only activity related to aeronautical operations), Ports, Sports Club/Health Club/Gymnasium/Swimming Pool attached to the Educational Institution Hospital provided said Sports Club/Health Club/Gymnasium/Swimming Pool is situated in the same premises and is primary meant for the students/faculty/employees/patients of such educational Institutions and Hospitals.

For the implementation of this circular as per serial no 4 the field officers are directed to ensure that where ever the tariff category is redefined or newly created by the commission, the existing / prospective consumer should be properly categorized by the actual field inspection immediately and the data to be immediately update in the IT data base.

All the field officer shall sensitize staff about various aspect of the tariff order and give proper guidance to all the officers and the staff members working under them. These are only important guidelines and for the actual implementation, the filed officers are requested to refer the detail order of MERC of 26.06.2015 in case of 121/2014.

I have gone through the application filed by the consumer/applicant regarding grievances and also gone through the point wise reply of the Respondent. It appears admittedly that the connection of the electric supply of the consumer is covered under the Hospital, Dispensary and Public Health Care Centre that is in the category of LT X (B). The applicant submitted Shop License certificate register on date 29/04/2015 in the name of applicant Mrs. Smita Khule to run Pathology Laboratory at Shop no 28, Plot No 50, Sadguru Piazza, sector 40 Nerul West, Navi Mumbai The applicant electricity connection

as per bill stands on the same name and address .The applicant prayed for the refund prior to 24 months from the date of filling of application to the respondent. Therefore, they are entitled for the said tariff from 1st June 2015. The applicant prayed for the refund prior to 24 months from the date of filling of application to the respondent but as per Electricity Act 2003 section 56(2), the limitation of recovery given only for 24 months. The CGRF is bound to give the recovery prior to 24 months of filing of case before CGRF. If we considered the MERC order which has given the conservation of tariff to the filed officer by sensitizing the staff appears to be the different from case to case. Therefore, at this juncture we have to see that the right of consumer is protected regarding refund is for 24 months from the date of application filing before CGRF. Hence, I found that the application made by the consumer regarding change of tariff which is already done by the Respondent to the consumer i.e. LTX (B). Now, question remains to decide is only about refund to be given .Therefore, the applicant consumer is entitled for last 24 months difference in the tariff as per LT X (B) excluding the period from the month when this tariff was changed by the Respondent from the date filing of this application before CGRF. As this amount of refund is out of the balance amount due to change of tariff therefore there is no need to grant interest in the result, the representation is hereby partly allowed. Hence proceed to pass following order.

ORDER

1. This application here by partly allowed.
2. The applicant is entitled for the refund of amount of 24 months prior to the date of filling this application to CGRF i.e. 23/10/2018. The period of getting tariff benefit from LTIIC to LTX (B) from date of conversion of tariff LTX (B) should be consider in these 24 months.
3. The Respondent MSEDCL shall do needful to adjust the refund the amount in the future bills.

4. Compliance of this order be made within one month from the receipt of this order.

I Agree/Disagree

I Agree/Disagree

**MRS. SHARMILA RANADE,
MEMBER
CGRF, BHANDUP**

**Dr. SANTOSHKUMAR JAISWAL
CHAIRPERSON
CGRF, BHANDUP**

**RAVINDRA S. AVHAD
MEMBER SECRETARY
CGRF, BHANDUP**

The order is issued under the seal of Consumer Grievance Redresses Forum M.S.E.D.C. Ltd., Bhandup Urban Zone, and Bhandup.

Note:

- a) The consumer if not satisfied, may file representation against this order before the Hon. Ombudsman within 60 days from the date of this order at the following address. " Office of the Electricity Ombudsman, Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission, 606, Keshav Building, Bandra - Kurla Complex, Bandra (E), Mumbai - 400 051"
- b) b) consumer, as per section 142 of the Electricity Act, 2003, can approach Hon'ble Maharashtra electricity Regulatory Commission for non-compliance, part compliance or
- c) Delay in compliance of this decision issued under" Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission (consumer Redressed Forum and Ombudsman) Regulation 2003" at the following address:-
"Maharashtra Electricity Regulatory Commission, 13th floor, world Trade Center, Cuffe Parade, Colaba, Mumbai 05"
- d) It is hereby informed that if you have filed any original documents or important papers you have to take it back after 90 days. Those will not be available after three years as per MERC Regulations and those will be destroyed.

