xkgd xklýk.ks fuokj.k ep

Yio| φ dk; nk] 2003 vrxh dye 42 Y5½ vlo; s LFkkfir½ egkjkV² jkT; fo| φ forj.k di uh Ye; khhr½ ifjeMy] ukf'kd

t k-Ø% I - I -@xkxkfue@uki@uk-'k-ea@uk-'k-fo-1@525@01@16&17@ fnukcd &13@05@2016

njladr cnyu feG.ksckcr

¼ jft 'Vj i kp Onkjs ½
 Xkk&gk. ks nk[ky fnukæd % 06@04@2016
 fuclky fnukæd % 13@05@2016

ifr]
1½ Jh- bł, I - V'kkdu]
pcj ua 214] fcYMhax ua1
ft Ygk U; k; ky; Vkokj]
ukf'kd
½k-da049018427337½
2½ ukMy Vf/kdkjh
e-jk-fot forj.k daiuh ½e; k½½
'kgj eMy dk; k½;] ukf'kd

3½ dk; dkjh VfHk; ark ¼ k&1-½]
e-jk-fot forj.k daiuh ½e; k½½
foHkkfx; dk; k½y;] ukf'kd

fu.k; i =

Jh- bl, l- v'kkdu gs fot forj.k diuhps xkgd vkgr R; kuh oht forj.k diuhdMs njlidr cny ψ feG.ks ckcr egkjk'V a jkT; fo|r forj.k diuhP; k virxir xkgd r \emptyset kj fuokj.k l ferhdMs r \emptyset kj nk[ky dsyh- i.k virxir xkgd r \emptyset kj fuokj.k l ferh P; k fu.kl; kus l ek/kku u >kY; kus vki ys xklýgk.ks R; kuh vu ψ ph v e/; s epkdMs l knj dsys rs epkdMs \emptyset ekid 71 vlo; s fn- 06@04@2016 jksth ukno.; kr vkys

expkP; k fn- 07@04@2016 P; k cBdhr gs idj.k l uko.khl ?ks; kpk fu.k%; ?ks; kr \vee kyk- \times kÚgk.ks \vee t kýph l uko.kh expkP; k dk; k¾y; kr fn- 22@04@2016 jksth l - 11-30 oktrk fuf' pr dj.; kr \vee kyh- ; k l ici/khph l upuk rØkjnkj \times kgd o forj.k di uhP; k l ici/kr \vee f/kdkÚ; kuuk fn- 07@04@2016 jksthP; k i =kUo; s ns; kr \vee kyh- ; kp i =kl kcr rØkj \vee t kýph i r ukMy \vee f/kdkjh] 'kgj eMG dk; k¾y;] ukf'kd ; kuuk nowu rØkj \vee t k¼u kj e jugk; \vee fHki k; 15 fnol kr expkdMs l knj dj.; kckcr o R; kph i r \times kgdkyk i kgkpfo.; kckcr l lipr dj.; kr \vee kys

I wko.khl fo | r forj.k di uhrQi ukMy vf/kdkjh Jh- lh- lh- ge.k] vfr- dk; ldkjh vfHk; rk Jh- ih- , l - ?kkMd] lgk; d ys[kkiky Jh- ih- vkj- ckEg.ks gs rj xkgd Lor% mifLFkr gkrs

xkgdkph ckt %

- 1- VIVI- bł, I V'kkdu ukf'kd dkN/kir odhyh djhr VI u R; kips VkVIDhI uicj 214 ft Ygk dkN/l Vkokjkr odhykips picj fcYMhax ua 1] nil &; k et Y; koj Vkgs R; kipk oht xkgd dł- 049018427337 VI k Vkgs
- 2- VKNKLV 2015 ikl u forj.k di uh dk; kly; kru fot ps fcy ogkogh feGr vkgs o vkti; ir fcykph loljDde Hkjysyh vkgs o ekpl 2016 ps fcyl (nk Hkjysys vkgs R; kph fcy HkjY; kph i korh l kcr tkMr vkgs, dqk efgl); kpk okij 20; (juVP; k [kkyh vkgs
- 3- R; kP; k fun'klukl vkys dh] forj.k di uhus fotph vkdkj.kh def'kl; y %okf.kT; ½ i/nrhus dsysyh vkgs ek- l fie dkb/kps fudkykiæk.ks odhykps dk; kly; def'kl; y %okf.kT; ½ Js khr; sr ukghodhykps poliph fcYMhaxl fnk def'kl; y %okf.kT; ½ okijkr ekbMr ukgh- rl p 'kkW vov yk; l bl ykxq gksr ukgh o egkuxjikyhdk?kjiVVh gh def'kl; y i/nrhus vkdkj.kh dsyh tkr ukgh- l cc oht vkdkj.kh ns[khy def'kl; y i/nrhus dj.ks pophps vkgs o R; kar noftrh gks ks t#jh vkgs
- 4- R; kauh rdkj fuokj.k d{k} 'kgj eMy ukf'kd ; kapadMs rdkj dsyh vl u R; kauh fnukad 10@03@2016 jksth vl s dGfoys vkgs dh] egkforj.kps okf.kT; d ifji=d da 175 fn- 05@09@2012 uu kj vkdkj.kh ; kX; vkgs ijarq R; k ifji=dkph iar ijk0; kdkeh ns; kr vkysyh ukgh o fnysyk fudkygh ; kX; o dk; nf'kj ukgh-

xkqdkP; k ekx.; k %

- 1- ikhy fcykph vkdkj.kh gh ?kjxrh okijkps Jskhus vkdkj.; kr ; koh
- 2-ekxhy | kr efgU; kr tknk | Hkjysyh jDde ikthy ; s kk&; k fcykru deh dj.; kr ; koh o ikthy fotsos fcyke/; s | nj tknk | Hkjysyh jDde oxldj.; kr ; koh fg fourh-

forj.k dauhph ckt%

forj.k diuhP; k orhus ukMy \vee f/kdkjh] ukf'kd 'kgj eMy; kuh i = fn- 20@04@16 0nkjs fnysyk \vee goky] I h-i h-, y- o brj i =0; ogkj epki ks I knj dsyk- \vee ki yh ckt w ekMrkuk forj.k diuhP; k i frfu/khuh i fri knu dsys dh%

- 1- Jh-bł, I V'kkodu] pocj uocj 214] fcYMhax ua 1 ft Ygk U; k; ky; vkokj] ukf'kd ; kuk 0; kol kf; d njkus oht vkdkj.kh gkr vlou R; k fBdk.kh iqki.ks odhyh 0; ol k; kl kBh dk; kły; Eg.kou okij gkr vkgs rl po okf.kT; hd ifji=d da 175 fn- 05@09@2012 uq kj Lor%ps okLr0; vl.kk&; k ?kjxorh fBdk.kh odhyh 0; ol k; vl sy rj v'kk fBdk.kh ?kjxorh njkus oht vkdkj.kh djrk ; bły-
- 2- xkgdkph I nj fBdk.kh oht tkM.kh gh iqki.ks 0; kolk; hd dk; k½y; ke/; s vI qu rFks ?kj×qrh okij ul Y; kus xkgdkyk oht fcykr vkdkj.; kr vkysyk okf.kT; hd njl idsr gk egkforj.kP; kfu; ekuq kj ; kX; vkgs R; keqGs xkgdkph rdkj [kkjht dj.; kr ; koh gh fourh-

vrxr rdkj fuokj.k d{kkph dk; bkgh

 $v_{t}x_{t}$ rdkj fuokj.k d{k ukf'kd 'kgj eMy dk; k $_{y}$; ; Fks fn-02@02@2016 jksth iklr >ky $_{y}$; k rdkjhph l $_{\mu}$ ko.kh fn- 15@02@2016 jksth i $_{\xi}$ hyizek.ks fu.k $_{\xi}$ ns; kr v_{y} kyk-

Rkdkjnkj xkgd; kuk vkdkj.; kr vkysyk okf.kT; hd njlædr gk egkforj.kps okf.kT; hd ifji=d dæ 175 fn- 05@09@2012 uøkj; k%; vkgs R; kr cny djrk; r ukgh-

epkps fu"d"12 %

1-rØkjnkj xkgdkps ukf'kd ftYgk dkWl vkokjkr odhykps picj fcYMhæe/; s odhyh dk; k½y; kps vkMQl vkgs R; k vkMQl l kBh R; kauh tys 15 ikl nu oht tkM.kh ?kryh vkgs R; kps vl s Eg.k.ks vkgs dh] forj.k di uhus fotsoh vkdkj.kh def'k½y %okf.kT; ½ i/nrhus

dsysyh vkgs odhykaps pacl joh fcYMhax def'ki, y ‰kf.kT; ½ okijkrekMr ukgh- ek- lajçe dkWkips fudkykçek.ks odhykaps dk; kiy; def'ki, y ‰kf.kT; ½ Jskhr; r ukgh- R; kauk 'kkW v®V ykxa gkrukgh o egkuxjikyhdk ?kjiVVh def'ki, y i/nrhus vkdkjyh tkrukgh- I cc fcykph vkdkj.kh gh ?kjxarh okijkps Jskhus dj.; kr; koh] v'kh R; kaph ekx.kh vkgs

2- fofo/k xkgdkl kBh nj l idr Bjo.; kps vf/kdkj egkjk"V^a fo|r fu; ked vk; kxkyk vl nu rs oGkoGh fu; rdkfydfjR; k Bjoys tkrkr- I/; k vk; kxkP; k vknsk ½-Ø- 12@2014½ fn- 26@06@2015 un kj ?kjxrh okijkP; k njl idrkl kBh ikhy çek.ks funk k vkgr%

"LT I (B): LT - Residential

Applicability: This category shall be applicable for electricity used at Low/Medium Voltage for operating various appliances used for purposes such as lighting, heating, cooling, cooking, washing/cleaning, entertainment/leisure, water pumping in the following places:

a) Private residential premises, Government/semi-Government residential quarters;

i) Residential premises used by professionals like Lawyers, Doctors, Professional Engineers, Chartered Accountants, etc., in furtherance of their professional activities in their residences, but shall not include Nursing Homes and any Surgical Wards or Hospitals;"

; ku(kj odhy] \fhk; ar] I unh \ys[kki ky b- çdkj P; k 0; kol kf; dkauk rs R; kaps 0; ol k; R; kap; k ?kj kruu djhr \vl Y; kl ?kj xrh okij kpk njl adsr \ykxw \vkgs ek= ; k 0; kol kf; dkaph dk; kay; s fcxj &?kj xrh fcxj & \vkf. k @fd abk 0; ki kjh bekj rhe/; s \vl Y; kl R; kauk ?kj xrh okij kpk njl adsr ykxw gks kkj ukgh-

ofdykpk 0; olk; gk 0; kikjh@okf.kT; oxbkjhr ekMr ukgh] gs ekU; vkgs ijrq rs gk 0; olk; R; kP; k ?kjk0; frjhä brj fBdk.kh ½mnk-fcxj&?kjxqrh] fcxj&vkn; kfxd vkf.k@fdæk 0; kikjh bekjrhe/; ½ djhrvl Y; kl rfkhy fotpk okij gk fuf'prfjR; k ?kjxqrh oxbkjhr ekMr ukgh-

3-; kp fok; koj Jh-jktæ th-'kkg fo-egkjk"VajkT; fo|r forj.k da kwrit petition no-6891 of 2010% gk , d nkok ek-erpl mPp U; k; ky; kdMs nk[ky >kyk gkrk-fn-2 vkWkLV 2011 P; k vknskk}kjs ek-erpl mPp U; k; ky; kus dog odhykP; k dk; kly; kl kBh okij.; kr; skkÚ; k tkxojhy oht okijkl kBh ?kjxrh njkus fotok vkdkj ykork; skkj ukgh] vl k fu.kl fnyk vkgs l njpk fu.kl [kkyhyçek.ks vkg%

".....The petitioner had thus admitted even in the plaint in the suit that the premises were used exclusively for the purpose of office not only by him but were shared with another advocate principally practicing in Mumbai. In view of the fact that the suit premises are exclusively used for the purpose of office, the petitioner is not entitled to claim that he should be charged for electricity consumed at the rate meant for domestic use, i.e. LT 1-Residential use. The user of the suit is clearly a nondomestic and non-residential. The executing Court below therefore did not commit any error in holding that the decree 23 WP 6891/2010 which was passed in RCS No. 194 of 2000 was non-executable in view of the fact that the revised tariff had been fixed by the MERC which make the classification of the tariff only on the basis of domestic and non-domestic uses and not on the basis of residential use as opposed to commercial use...."

4-; k vknskr ek- U; k; ky; kus; kckcr i khyçek. ks I folrj er uknoys vkg%

"......Admittedly, offices of professional persons like lawyers, doctors etc. would not fall in any of the categories from LT-III to LT-IX. The short question that arises for my consideration is whether a lawyer's office or a doctor's clinic would fall under the category LT-I (domestic) or LT-II (non-domestic). By no stretch of imagination, the premises which are used exclusively for the purpose of an office of a lawyer or an office of a chartered accountant or a dispensary/clinic of a doctor can be regarded as a domestic use. In a sense, a lawyer, a chartered accountant or a doctor does not carry on any commercial activity. The vocation of a lawyer, a chartered accountant and a doctor is regarded in common parlance as a "profession" contra-distinguished from a commerce.. But certainly these vocations are not domestic vocations like avocation of a housewife. The classification made by the MERC for charging electricity is not "residential use" as opposed to "commercial use". The classification is made by the MERC as "domestic use" as opposed to "nondomestic use". The use of any premises exclusively for an office of a lawyer or an office of a chartered accountant or a dispensary/clinic of a doctor cannot be regarded as domestic use. The domestic use in common parlance is where a person 16 WP 6891/2010 or family resides; it ordinarily has a living space and a cooking space. We are not concerned with exceptional cases wherein there may be a domestic use without there being a separate cooking space like a single person taking premises on rent for his residence but eating out everyday with no cooking space in the premises occupied by him. Similarly, the premises which are exclusively used for profession may have a facility of a pantry or a cooking space where tea or coffee is prepared for serving to the staff and/or clients/patients but that would not make the use of the premises as a domestic use. The face of all professions is changing. Though still a vast majority of lawyers, who essentially carry on the profession of pleading in the Court, use their residence as an office where they meet their clients; and that may still be the face of a traditional lawyer practising in smaller cities and towns. However in large commercial metro-cities, multi partner lawyers firms dominate the legal profession. Some of

them carry on every activity of legal profession but pleading in the Court. They do the drafting and conveyancing work relating to the sale and transfer of properties, they do legal financial work relating to public issues and raising of capital (debt or equity), they undertake completing all legal formalities for obtaining of various licences, sanctions and do legal consultancy and every 17 WP 6891/2010 work other than pleading in the Court. Can their activity be regarded as a domestic activity? Even a man on the street would not call it to be a domestic activity. Similar is the case in respect of large firms of chartered accountants. Doctors have polyclinics, laboratories, diagnostic centres in their clinics. In such large offices and clinics, there may be a place used as kitchen or a pantry for preparation of tea and coffee and even for warming of food which the professionals may often consume in the office. But such use cannot be regarded as a "domestic use". The tariff entries fixed by the MERC for charging for electricity consumed are "domestic" and "nondomestic" user and not "residential" or "commercial" user. Every non-domestic use may not be a commercial use, but nonetheless it is not a domestic use. The user of the premises by doctors, lawyers or chartered accountants exclusively for the purpose of carrying on their profession, in the facts and circumstances as they exist today, though cannot be regarded as a commercial use, is certainly not a domestic use. It is a non-domestic use and therefore the tariff payable for the electric power consumed would be as applicable for non-domestic user...."

5-rØkjnkj xkgdkuh ek-lokPp U; k; ky; kP; k fu.k½ kpk mYys[k dsyk vkgs ek= lnj fu.k½ kph çr vFkok ri'khy fnysyk ukgh-rFkkfi oj lnHkhir vknskkr ek-lokPp U; k; ky; kP; k v'kk , dk çdj.kkrhy fu.k½ kpk mYys[k [kkyhyçek.ks dsyk vkg%

".....

10. A copy of the decision, though unreported, rendered on the reference by a Bench of three Hon'ble Judges of the Supreme Court on 27th October 2005 in Civil Appeal No. 1065 of 2000 (the Chairman, M.P. Electricity Board vs. Shiv Narayan), has been placed before me by the learned counsel for the petitioner. The Larger Bench of the Supreme Court held that the tariff entries classify user into two categories, namely (a) domestic purposes and (b) commercial and non-domestic purposes. This is done statutorily in exercise of the powers under section 49 of the Electricity (Supply) Act, 1948. The classification clubs the commercial and non-domestic purposes into one category. The Court was of the view that question whether an advocate can be said to be carrying on commercial activity did not call for a decision for deciding the applicability of the rate of the charges for electricity used by him. As the user of the premises by an advocate for his office was admittedly not "domestic", it would fall in the category of 13 WP 6891/2010 "commercial and non-domestic". For any non-domestic use, the commercial rates were to be charged. The Supreme Court further held that exclusively running an office (of an advocate) was clearly a non-domestic uses......"

Okjhy fu.k? ku(kkj ek-lokPp U; k; ky; kus ns[khy <u>doG</u>(exclusively) odhykP; k dk; k?y; kl kBh tkxpk okij vl Y; kl rks fcxj&?kjxrh Bjoyk vkg? R; ke(Gs rØkjnkj xkgdkP; k ofdyk1 kBhP; k proj e/khy vkMQl lkBh ?kjxrh njkus oht vkdkj ykokok] gh fourh ekU; djrk; skkj ukgh-

xkgdkps i from u] fo | or forj.k di uhpk [kgykl k o l knj dj.; kr vkysyh dkxni = s ; k l o l ckchopk fopkj d#u exp ; k çdj.kh [kkyhy i æk.ks fu.k]; nsr vkgs

fu.kţ

- 1 rØkjnkj xkgdkP; k ofdykl kBhP; k proje/khy vkMQl l kBh ?kjxrh njkus oht vkdkj ykokok] gh fourh QVkG.; kr ; r vkgs
- 2; k fu.k², k fo#/n rØkjnkj ; kuk vihy djko; kps vl Y; kl] egkjk²Vª fo|r fu; ked vk; ks ½xkgd xkÚgk.ks fuokj.k epo o fo|r yksdiky½] fofu; e 2006 e/khy fu; e Ø- 17-2 ul kj ek- fo|r yksdiky ; kpsdMs] ½0nkjk & egkjk²Vª oht fu; ked vk; ksz] 606] ^ds kok** cæyk] ckmk dkÆyÐl ½irp½ ercb& 400051½; Fks; k vkns kkP; k fnukadkikluu 60 fnol kP; k vkr rs vihy d#′kdrkr-

1/3 kt u fl - dayd.khl ½1/3 esk oa f'konkl¼ l jísk i ka ok?k ½I nL;I nL; &I fpoV/; {k

 $\times k$ - $\times k$ -fu-ea] ukf'kd ifjeMG

ir ekfarhl kBh o ; kX; R; k dk; bkahl kBh v×f'kr %

1-e([; \sqrt{fHk} ; rk]e-jk-fo-fo-da½e; k½½ifjeMG dk; k½y;] ukf'kdjkM 422101 ½dk; dkjh \sqrt{fHk} ; rk itkkl uÀ; kps djhrk½

2-eq[; \vee fHk; rk] e-jk-fo-fo-da‰e; k½½ji fjeMG dk; k½y;]ukf' kdjkM 422101 ½t ul i dl \vee f/kdkjh; kps djhrk½

 $3-\sqrt{f/k}\{kd\sqrt{fHk}; rk\} = -jk-fo-fo-da\%e; kl\%'kgj = eMy dk; kl\%;] ukf'kd$